

Appendix B

Minutes of April 4, 2018 CHC Meeting

COMMUNITY HERITAGE COMMISSION

**April 4, 2018 6:00p.m.
Committee Room #2, City Hall**

MINUTES

VOTING MEMBERS PRESENT:

Councillor Jaimie McEvoy	- Chair
Maureen Arvanitidis	- Community Member
John Davies	- Vice-Chair, Community Member
Deane Gurney	- Community Member
Rosanne Hood	- NWHPS Representative
Lauren Neufeld	- Community Member (left at 7:25)
Lynn Radbourne	- Community Member
David Sarraf	- Community Member

GUESTS:

Stefan Aepli	- Francel Architecture
Joe Carreira	- Conwest Group
Carla Jones	- Holy Trinity Cathedral
Donald Luxton	- Donald Luxton and Associates

STAFF:

Rupinder Basi	- Senior Development Planner
Britney Quail	- Heritage Planner
Heather Corbett	- Committee Clerk

The meeting was called to order at 6:03 p.m.

1.0 ADDITIONS TO AGENDA

There were no additions to the agenda.

2.0 ADOPTION OF MINUTES

2.1 Adoption of the Minutes of March 7, 2018

MOVED and SECONDED

THAT the minutes of the March 7, 2018 Community Heritage Commission meeting be adopted.

CARRIED.

All members of the Commission present voted in favour of the motion.

3.0 PRESENTATIONS

3.1 514 Carnarvon Street: Holy Trinity Cathedral HRA, OCP, SDP Applications

Mr. Rupinder Basi, Senior Planner, summarized the report dated April 4, 2018, regarding the proposal for a 30 storey residential tower at 514 Carnarvon Street, adjacent to the Holy Trinity Cathedral. The application also proposes to conduct interior renovations, a seismic upgrade and restoration of the exterior of the cathedral, legally protect the cathedral and provide new parish space and a publicly accessible plaza.

Mr. Basi reviewed the project details, including the height of the tower, the number and breakdown of residential units, the ground level layout, the provision of parking, and a publicly accessible pedestrian plaza, corridor and elevator. He also noted the existing Official Community Plan designation and the conditions of the Heritage Revitalization Agreement, which would provide long-term legal protection to the cathedral through a Heritage Designation Bylaw.

In response to a question from the Commission, Mr. Basi introduced Joe Carreira from Conwest Group, who he identified as the co-applicant, along with the Holy Trinity Church, represented by Carla Jones, a warden of the church.

Carla Jones, Warden at Holy Trinity, discussed the importance of maintaining the church, which has been on the same site since 1859, and the immense amount of restoration and seismic upgrading that it requires. Ms. Jones also discussed the Church's wish to restore its stained glass and maintain its vibrant community, which uses the parish hall extensively for social and community based programs.

Don Luxton, Donald Luxton & Associates, provided a PowerPoint presentation covering the following information:

- History of the building and the benefits for the restoration, including:
 - Seismic upgrades to ensure life safety;
 - Preservation of the primary and historic use of the building, lending community support and space for faith-based gathering in the downtown;
 - Conservation of the building , which will be possible via investment and development of the remnant land on the church property;

- Details of the improvements and seismic upgrades, including gentler interventions on the interior of the building;
- Details of the community plaza, parish hall and offices, including barrier-free access, lighting and safety;
- Investment in heritage assets, including functionality improvements and code upgrades to the church; and,
- How the design team had considered the residential building and its design in the context of Standard 11 in the *Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada* (2010).

Stefan Aepli, Francel Architecture, reviewed the rendering of the residential tower and provided comments on the urban context of the building. Mr. Aepli discussed the concept of the new building shape, which has taken cues from the church and its bell tower and has been translated into a contemporary building through the use of stepping and colouring. Mr. Aepli also discussed the public plaza and the incorporation of the current lawn space into the building as flex units.

In response to questions from the Commission, Mr. Luxton and Mr. Aepli provided the following information:

- There is no information on when or how the turret on the bell tower was removed from the building;
- There is no evidence of burial grounds on the property, however there is a memorial garden, and all remains will be un-interred and re-located to the far east side of the church;
- The parish hall that is being replaced is a concrete block structure, utilitarian in nature and in disrepair – it is of minimal heritage value compared to the cathedral;
- The church faces southeast, therefore no matter how tall the new structure would be, whether 12, 20 or 30 storeys, there would be a shadow on the church as of 1:30 pm;
- The residential tower has been designed 30 storeys high in order to be economically feasible to provide the required restoration on the church, secured rental, and non-market rental housing;
- The balance of community benefits, i.e. the number of affordable housing and market rental units that have been built in, was reached in conjunction with City staff;
- The current passageway between the church and parish hall is shadowed, so no loss of sunlight will be felt on the plaza
- When looking up Church Street, there are currently trees in front of the church – this view will be maintained;
- The intention of the building on Clarkson Street is to create an urban edge and to complete the streetscape;
- The elevator is proposed as glass on two sides;
- The elevator would be owned by the building and maintained by the strata;

Mr. Basi and Ms. Britney Quail noted that the aim of including the elevator in the project is to provide a public and accessible approach to the SkyTrain as well as to the church and plaza. In regards to safety concerns, the elevator would be reviewed by staff and the New Westminster Design Panel from a CPTED perspective.

In response to further questions from the Commission, Ms. Jones, Mr. Luxton and Mr. Aepli provided the following information:

- The current parish hall is located to the west of the church, creating a narrow pathway for pedestrians to pass through;
- The current parish hall would be replaced by a two-level hall at the base of the residential tower, including a full kitchen for community events and a second level for church offices;
- The new parish hall would be marginally larger in terms of square footage, but would have much more functionality;
- The term “subordinate to” in the language of Standard 11 means respectful, drawing less attention to itself, being a good neighbour, quieter than etc. – the intention is for a building to be respectful, not that it needs to be smaller.
- The intention of the architect has been to make the base of the tower visually compatible and complimentary to the church, in terms of its form, massing and materials – the tower has been designed as a quietly elegant response to the church that doesn’t overpower it;
- The church and plaza will be well lit in evenings;
- A meeting has been set up with the City to improve the eastern approach to the church along Carnarvon Street, as the road is City property;
- The value of the heritage restoration work is approximately \$12 million, including the seismic upgrades, interior and exterior restoration, parking, and parish hall;
- The church will share ownership of the market rental units, and will receive revenue which will generate ongoing funds to maintain the heritage building;
- The agreement for ownership of the rental units will be for 60 years or the life of the building, whichever is longer;
- The affordable housing units will be operated by the Holy Trinity Church Housing Society;
- The congregation of the church is usually 80 people on a weekly basis, however the parish roll is 180-200; and,
- The cathedral seats approximately 200 people.

In response to a question regarding the timeline for the project, Mr. Basi noted that there are still a number of steps for the project to go through as part of the OCP amendment and HRA application processes. Development Services is targeting a public hearing in early 2019, with construction beginning in 2020. The project would not likely come back to the Community Heritage Commission.

Upon discussion, the Commission noted the following comments:

- It would be preferable for the whole of the church to stand out and be visible from all approaches, particularly from Church Street, without the obstruction of trees;
- The tower's urban fronting face on Clarkson and is too contrasted to the church and would benefit from elements that reflect the style of the church through distinctive windows or brick work;
- Window designs could be incorporated into the building beneath the plaza to mimic the church;
- Ensuring safety of the site and the elevator through CPTED, lighting, and security is of utmost importance; and,
- Emphasizing and maximizing views of the church is most important.

MOVED AND SECONDED

THAT the Community Heritage Commission recommend that Council support the Heritage Revitalization Agreement for 514 Carnarvon Street (Holy Trinity Cathedral), with the Commission's suggested modifications being addressed.

CARRIED.

Rosanne Hood voted in opposition of the motion.

Procedural Note: The Commission recessed and reconvened at 7:25 p.m. Lauren Neufeld left the meeting.

3.2 Heritage Orientation No. 2 – Heritage in the Municipal Context

Britney Quail, Heritage Planner, provided a PowerPoint orientation presentation regarding heritage in the municipal context.

Ms. Quail led discussion and highlighted information relevant to the Commission in regards to:

- The definition and types of heritage, using examples of UNESCO sites;
- Heritage conservation jurisdictions, and the difference between Federal and Provincial jurisdictions;
- Heritage tools and categories, such as protection areas, recognition types and interpretive methods;
- Types of protection and the tools used by the City for protecting assets, i.e. covenants, heritage designation bylaws, heritage revitalization agreements and heritage conservation areas; and,
- The Commission's role in the discussion of heritage within New Westminster and suggestions for the Commission to consider when evaluating heritage items.