

REPORT Climate Action, Planning and Development

To: Community Heritage Commission **Date**: October 6, 2021

From: Samantha Bohmert, Planning Assistant File: HER00843

Item #: [Report Number]

Subject: Heritage Review (Demolition): 1212 and 1214 Fifth Avenue

PURPOSE

To review the heritage value of the buildings and provide a recommendation on demolition.

SUMMARY

Two houses are being considered for demolition. The house at 1212 Fifth Avenue was constructed in 1907 in a modest, single storey cottage style. The house at 1214 Fifth Avenue was constructed in 1909 in a two storey gabled vernacular style. The buildings, in the Brow of the Hill neighbourhood, are in poor condition and reflect several interventions and alterations over time. The buildings are not legally protected, nor listed on the City's Heritage Register or Inventory. However, as a result of their ages, the Community Heritage Commission is being asked to review for heritage value, in advance of the Director's consideration of Demolition Permits.

GUIDING POLICY AND REGULATIONS

100 Year and Older Heritage Review Policy

In 2020, Council approved a revised heritage review policy, which highlights the City's interest in retaining New Westminster's oldest buildings. As such, redevelopment applications for buildings that are 100 years and older require a Heritage Assessment and review by the Community Heritage Commission.

Demolition Permits

Demolition Permits are issued by the Director of Development Services, though the Director may forward the application to Council for further consideration, or consideration of a temporary protection order where warranted.

Temporary Protection Order

A temporary protection order may be issued by Council for a property that is or may be considered to have heritage value sufficient to justify its conservation. This can include properties that are not listed on the Heritage Register. Without consent of the owner, a temporary protection order may only last 60 days, after which the permit must be issued.

Heritage Designation

A Heritage Designation Bylaw is a form of land use regulation that places long-term protection on the land title of a property and which is the primary form of regulation that can prohibit demolition. Heritage Designation does not require owner consent. However, without consent of the owner, the owner is entitled under Provincial law, to claim compensation for loss of zoning entitlement value from the Designation.

BACKGROUND INFORMATION

Site Characteristics

1212 Fifth Avenue

Built in 1907, this is a one storey house with a basement. The building has an area of 156 square metres (1,676 square feet) and is on a 650 square metre (7,000 square foot) lot. It has a floor space ratio of 0.24 and a site coverage of 12%. Though changes have likely been made to the house, there are no permits on record. Current photographs of the building are included in Appendix A.

1214 Fifth Avenue

Built in 1909, this is a two storey house with a basement. The building has an area of 239 square metres (2,568 square feet) and is on a 650 square metre (7,000 square foot) lot. It has a floor space ratio of 0.37 and a site coverage of 12.76%. Though changes have likely been made to the house, there are no permits on record. Current photographs of the building are included in Appendix B.

Location and Context

The properties are on the south side of Fifth Avenue, between Twelfth and Thirteenth Streets, in the Brow of the Hill neighbourhood. They are surrounded by single detached

dwellings and low rise multi-unit residential buildings, which is typical for the neighbourhood. The single detached dwellings range in age from 1908 to 1937 and three are recognized on the Heritage Inventory, an informal listing of historic properties. The buildings in question are consistent in age with this streetscape. There is a commercial building nearby fronting Twelfth Street. A site context map is included in Appendix C.

Development Policy and Regulations

The sites are zoned Single Detached Residential Districts (RS-2), which permits a single detached house and a secondary suite to a maximum size of 0.51 floor space ratio. All properties on the block, including the sites, are designated Residential – Multiple Unit Buildings (RM) in the Official Community Plan (OCP). The intent of this designation is to provide a mix of small to moderate sized multiple unit residential buildings. Therefore, a development application that included these properties may allow a townhouses or a mid-rise building.

Heritage Protection

The buildings are not legally protected nor listed on the City's Heritage Register or Inventory. However, they are over 100 years old. Under the current zoning, no heritage-related permits or Council approvals are required for construction of new houses on the sites. However, the current houses were flagged for review for potential heritage value due to their age.

ITEMS FOR DISCUSSION

1212 Fifth Avenue

Heritage Value

The style is a blend of the Gabled Vernacular and Neoclassical cottage styles. Character defining elements include its hipped roof and hipped gable, wood frame windows, and internal brick chimney. The building has historic value associated with its owners and age. The current owners, the Yakinovich/Chipak family, have owned the site since 1961. The modest cottage represents an early stage in the neighbourhood development of Brow of the Hill.

Building Condition

A heritage assessment was completed in August 2021, which indicates the building is in poor condition. The siding (porcelain tile and insul-brick) is not original, although traces of the original siding is found underneath. The original door has been replaced. Some of the window sashes have been replaced with non-wood materials. The front window is likely an intervention in the 1930s. Changes to the massing of the building include a

shed roof addition at the rear, which may be a filled in porch, and possible alterations to the front entrance. An assessment is included as Appendix D.

1214 Fifth Avenue

Heritage Value

The building is in the gabled vernacular style. Character defining elements include the front gable roof, projected tympanum, inset front porch, wood frame windows, stained glass and bay windows, diamond shaped attic window, narrow lap siding on the rear addition, and an internal brick chimney.

The building has historic value associated with its owners, developer, architect, and age. The current owners, the Yakinovich/Chipak family, have owned the site since 1950. The developer, Edgar Hugh Sands, emigrated from the United Kingdom, settled in New Westminster, and was a member of the Board of Trade of New Westminster. The architect, Edmund Boughen, also emigrated from the United Kingdom, and practiced on-and-off in New Westminster and Vancouver until at least after World War II. The building represents an early stage in the neighbourhood development of Brow of the Hill.

Building Condition

A heritage assessment was completed in August 2021, which indicates the building is in poor condition. The original siding was removed and replaced with bottle-dash stucco in the 1930's. The front porch was enclosed and the window openings on the ground floor at the front are atypical. The windows are wood; some of the window sashes have been replaced with non-wood material. In the 1950's, a single storey rear addition, without basement, was added. The assessment is included as Appendix E.

FEEDBACK FROM THE COMMMISSION

The following options are available for consideration by the Community Heritage Commission:

- That the Community Heritage Commission recommend the Director of Development Services issue the Demolition Permits for 1212 and 1214 Fifth Avenue, and that the applicant consider deconstruction as an alternative to demolition waste; or
- 2) That the Community Heritage Commission recommend the Director of Development Services direct staff to further explore retention options (i.e. redevelopment or relocation) for the house at 1212 and/or 1214 Fifth Avenue; or
- 3) That the Community Heritage Commission provide an alternative recommendation, based on their discussions.

ATTACHMENTS

Appendix A: Photos of 1212 Fifth Avenue Appendix B: Photos of 1214 Fifth Avenue:

Appendix C: Site Context Map

Appendix D: Heritage Assessment for 1212 Fifth Avenue Appendix E: Heritage Assessment for 1214 Fifth Avenue

This report was prepared by: Samantha Bohmert, Planning Assistant

This report was reviewed and approved by: Britney Dack, Senior Heritage Planner